



# Environment, Housing & Technical Services Scrutiny Panel

## Quarterly Meeting with the Minister for Transport and Technical Services

**THURSDAY, 22nd MAY 2015**

**Panel:**

Connétable A.S. Crowcroft of St. Helier (Chairman)

Deputy D. Johnson of St. Mary

Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade

**Witnesses:**

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services

Chief Officer

Director of Transport

Director of Operations

[10:01]

**Connétable A.S. Crowcroft of St. Helier (Chairman):**

We welcome the Minister for Transport and Technical Services and his Chief Officer and Director of Municipal Services.

**Director of Operations:**

Operations.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Operations. To this second public hearing of the E.H.T.S. (Environment, Housing and Technical Services) Scrutiny Panel. I am the Chairman, Simon Crowcroft, Constable of St. Helier.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Thank you very much. I am pleased to welcome the media also to our hearing and our clerks. Minister, since we met in February we wanted to start off by talking about resources. How confident are you that the needs you have for resources are going to be met in the forthcoming M.T.F.P. (Medium-Term Financial Plan)?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Resources across the States as a whole are going to be challenging. As you are aware we are looking at substantial savings over the next 3 years and so that affects all departments but we are confident that we will be able to provide the services we need to provide within the budgets that we are given.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Will there be any growth bids from your department?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We have had growth bids. In particular covering income shortfalls. For example, there has been a drop off in the tipping fees expected coming into La Collette. So, yes, those growth bids are in and we are confident of having the resources to be able to meet the demands for the services that we need to provide.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Is it expected that there will be any job losses as a result?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There has always been, as you are aware, there has been a V.R. (voluntary redundancy) proposal launched. It is starting on 1st June. It is going to run for a month in the first phase. So, yes, we are looking at a reduction in manpower across the States as a whole.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Are you reappointing where posts become vacant through what is called natural wastage?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are managing vacancies to see which posts are essential to be replaced.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Will they be replaced at the same terms and conditions or is that where the likely savings are to come?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There is quite a metrics there. It depends if the role is a like for like replacement or we are taking the opportunity to look at someone who retires, for example, to look at their role to see how it can be best ... the services that that is linked to can be best provided.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Can I ask about non-replacement and manual worker posts because I think we all agree that the work done by a manual worker, whether it is in parks and gardens or street maintenance is ... it is what it is. You cannot ... if you are a gardener, for example, you cannot garden any faster. So is there not a risk that if you are not replacing manual worker posts then the quality of the parks and gardens administered by T.T.S. (Transport and Technical Services) or the roads cleaned by T.T.S. will simply be done less frequently or with less ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, there are always productivity gains you can get. There are always efficiency gains you can get and to us that is business as usual. It is normal. You look at your operations to see at every opportunity how you can improve the service more efficiently.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Are there any areas which could be privatised to save money?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Particularly within T.T.S.?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Yes.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Parts of what we do are done by the private sector, so there are always opportunities but you have to look at everything in a realistic manner.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Is it probably a good time to turn to the document which is circulated about the statutory, discretionary and committed services that your department provides in terms of where the changes are likely to be in service provision, if at all?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We could do this but that is not actually on the agenda that you forwarded to us. I would like to stick to the agenda; that is why we have come with "T.T.S. lite" to speak in terms of officer presence. I mean the whole purpose of having an agenda is so we can do the work to answer the questions covering those topics. So I would like to keep on piste if I may. If it is going to be a different form, sort of questions without notice form, then it requires a different preparation. We have prepared ...

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Yes, that is fair enough.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

... for the agenda that has been given to us.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Okay. I was trying to follow question 3, I hope we are all singing from the same hymn sheet, which essentially is the ... you provided us with a list of services that your department provides. Are there any proposals to outsource any of those services that you provide on a discretionary basis?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Just to clarify, you said question 3, you are talking about the topic about waste management?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Yes.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

I think we are talking about resources in general.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is topic one.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Are we on the same hymn sheet?

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Question 3 of topic one is about the possibility of outsources.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We have not seen a question sheet.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

These are our notes. Whether there is any plan to outsource services that you currently provide.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I just want to introduce Tristan Dodd, our Director of Transport. He has been representing us at planning meetings, so just to give you ...

**Director of Transport:**

Apologies for being delayed.

**Chief Officer:**

In terms of outsourcing and that question. What we have done and what T.T.S. always does is look at each service and does a review of how that service is performing, how could we do it differently, how can we make it more efficient, and how can we increase the productivity of it. It is work we have been doing with the Parish recently in terms of working more closely with the Parish Hall, some of our parks and gardens assets, and the town cleaning, which is a key thing we have been working on. What we do not start things off by saying is we have got to do it or we have got to protect it. The thing I think for the public of Jersey to know is that we try and to do it as efficiently as possible to the best level we can. So we do a service review. Once that service review is done that will have options, which will include options out here which is massive outsourcing or doing it internally. Then those options will be put forward and we will review them and see if that is of benefit to ... in terms of the cost base and in terms of the sustainability moving forward. We are going to have our budgets cut so we cannot keep doing the same thing we are doing now. What we have done over the last 12 months is being restricted on vacancy replacement. But you can only do that for a certain period of time because what that does is it closes your business down and your service starts suffering, as the Constable mentioned.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

That is my point about gardening. You cannot garden without hands.

**Chief Officer:**

But we have got quite various ways. You can invest in some automation or do it differently or you can invest in infrastructure which allows more things to be in one place. You can then get better productivity out of less people.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

With my E.H.T.S. hat rather than my Parish hat, I know you are having discussions at officer level with the Parishes about certain services could be transferred, and I do not know where they are, where those discussions have gone, I have not been briefed about that, but if, when you transfer a service, you have to also transfer a budget I am struggling to see where the saving is from your point of view. Is it in management costs that you make the saving?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The only Parish we talk to is yourself, and we have not had that discussion yet.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Just in terms of the principle. If you were to hand certain responsibility say for a particular park over to a Parish the Parish presumably would not take that without taking some budget to do it, so where is the advantage from your point of view for that? Equally a street-cleaning function that was transferred to a Parish, there would have to be a budget to go with that or the Parish presumably would not take it on.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Perhaps by working together that essentially is about sort of location workforce. It might be that, you know ...

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

To be more efficient?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Two plus 2 does not equal 4 in that sense. It might be 3 and a half and so you get the savings.

**Director of Operations:**

Sometimes the Parish runs their services, like some of the parks and gardens differently to T.T.S. so you might run your services more efficiently than perhaps we do and we can learn from that. So I think it is about looking at what is best practice in running or maintaining parks, and picking up from that.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Is there any scope within that for perhaps rationalising this? This seems to go between what the States do, what the Parish does, and then what perhaps Property Holdings would do or somebody who is an outsourced gardener, et cetera, might do. Certainly from a public perspective it is not always clear who is responsible for what. Is there any chance of economic savings from consolidating those services?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There are always opportunities to be more efficient and to do more with the same resources or to do more with less resources. To us that is business as normal. We are always looking at that. It is a similar ethos within Property Holdings.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

In the context of budget cuts you mentioned, are there any areas where you see scope for making charges and levies which have not yet been made against the public generally or particularly organisations?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are always looking to maintain our income or increase our income to provide additional services. It is something I have already politically said. I said in my speech back in November that I favoured charging for commercial waste, for example. It seems a bit ludicrous that we are effectively subsidising property developers when they bring their waste to the Energy from Waste plant; it is disposal for free. We have had other discussions about other areas. Perhaps a way of making our liquid waste services more sustainable and more self-sufficient in the future and to be able to bring more people on to the mains network may require some form of funding mechanism, be that a charge.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Would you agree with me, Minister, that we are probably one of the only places, certainly in the developed world, where there is no charge for waste? So there is no incentive to produce less of it.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Having charges, for example, gate fees to the Energy from Waste plant or gate fees for disposal of rubbish or charges generally for dealing with that, with our waste, be it solid or liquid, particularly in the solids side, if you have not got a charging mechanism it makes recycling less attractive in terms of ... there is no financial incentive to recycle, but if you have a gate fee there is.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Have you looked at ... because Guernsey clearly has a gate fee?

**Chief Officer:**

I am not aware of anywhere else that does not have a gate fee, particularly on a plant of our standard. I am not aware of anywhere.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Can you just rehearse for us the reasons why we do not have a gate fee?

**Chief Officer:**

That is a great question from the Constable, is it not?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

One of the biggest areas is the covenant.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

The covenant. Can you just explain because perhaps the public do not know what?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Back in early 1900s ...

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

1950-something, was it?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

1967. The States wanted to utilise some land in Bellozanne that was in the ownership of the Parish and that was granted on the basis that a covenant was put on that land that meant that the Parish of St. Helier could take their waste to the facility at that time for disposal at no cost.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

My understanding, because this came up during the relocation of the incinerator to La Collette, that even though the incinerator moved the covenant still meant the Parish of St. Helier could take its waste to Bellozanne where it would have to be dealt with for free.

[10:15]



**Chief Officer:**

That is an opinion, yes. The dilemma is whether it was about the destructors, which were the asset that was on that piece of land or whether it was the piece of land, and that is the discussion we will have in another forum.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Are you doing anything ... because clearly the inability to charge for waste means that the recycling is always going to be up to the good nature and the environmental conscience of the public. It is not something that you can have any kind of leverage over. As you say, you cannot charge for commercial waste because if that is generated in St. Helier the covenant will kick in. I mean it has to be disposed of for nothing according to some legal opinions. So are you doing anything ... you have not discussed it with me with my other hat on, so I am just wondering what you are doing, if anything, about it?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are taking legal advice to see what our options are, going to be able to allow for the covenant to be lifted.

**Chief Officer:**

I think we will be talking to you very soon over that specific issue.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

I raise this just because it is, in terms of it is an environmental issue, that everywhere else are trying to encourage recycling and make their waste facilities last longer but they encourage the public through charges to say: "The more waste you create the more you pay for its ..." I mean it seems to be logical.

**Chief Officer:**

Absolutely. And it sets up a great business opportunity for lots of small and medium businesses to do the recycling. Guernsey's a great example with a gate fee of ... I think it is going to be £170-odd a tonne. It means that if you can recycle it for £150 a tonne it becomes a viable business for the Island. Guernsey has got an enormous amount of people in employment in that business and we are not utilising those resources or employing those people, which is a great shame.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

In a sense the Chair might be slightly awkward in his ... having a dual capacity, so we are happy to, ask as Vice-Chairman: is that maybe some pressure should be put on St. Helier to release the covenant.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

As I said, we are taking legal advice and will be pursuing that advice in due course.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

See you in court. Right, can we move on to another very contentious issue, which is around taxi regulation. The Minister was very bold in his initial speech for the job that he would be the first Minister in many to come up with some meaningful changes to how taxis and cabs operate. Can you perhaps give us an update?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Since the beginning of the year both myself and my Assistant Minister have put a great deal of time and effort into researching the taxi provision within the Island. We have been speaking with the main industry representatives, be they from the taxi side or the cab side. We have been going out to see the evening economy and the early morning economy. I can confirm that my views on the future of the taxi regulation policy are now pretty well formed. I understand that there has been a lot of uncertainty for quite some for the drivers and those involved in the industry and I am looking to go public with the recommendations that we are going to be pursuing in the latter part of July. The reason for that timing is I have asked for some additional pieces of work to be done by officers and I am also taking some legal opinions on some of the aspects but hope to be making a public announcement in July.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Are we still looking at a unified system? Is that the term for it? Is that the preferred option?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There are several systems that can be. Currently we have a hybrid of a 2-tier system that intermingle, that does not seem to suit either side of those parties. So going forward we will be looking to try and resolve some of those issues that that current 2-tier hybrid system throws up.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

I think there is a public perception at least that taxi fares, cab fares in Jersey are quite expensive compared to other places. Do you think fares are likely to go up or come down or stay the same as a result of your work?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There is a certain lack of transparency within the current arrangement, rank taxis are controlled effectively by the Government; through myself as Minister those fares are set. Fares for private hire are not currently controlled. The previous Minister did write to the industry last year saying

that regulation will be coming in for that side of the industry in terms of controlling tariffs, and that is something that has not changed. But we are looking at doing that. Again, detailed analysis will be made in July.

**Director of Transport:**

Can I just add a little to that please? If you look in the White Paper that was released at the end of last year, I think it was the end of ... beginning of last year. In the appendix there are some comparators for the controlled fares, which is the rank fares, with other towns and jurisdictions in the U.K. (United Kingdom) and you will find that they are not disproportionately expensive. The problem is, as the Minister referred to, lack of transparency where you get a private hire cab and you pay one fare and then you get a rank fare and you pay a different fare for the same journey, and that was to do with the deregulation of the fares for private hire.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Why is competition not driving down prices in the taxi? It seems to be those ... the cabs tend to be more expensive than rank taxis but it is the rank ones which are regulated, so that seems like an example where competition is not driving prices down. What is the reason for that?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is more of a question for C.I.C.R.A. (Channel Islands Competition Regulatory Authority). I know C.I.C.R.A. would like us to deregulate the industry. That is not something I favour, particularly in an industry where you have some 400 individuals employed in the industry and their families, and to completely do what C.I.C.R.A. would like us to do, which is deregulate, would put the livelihood of those individuals and their families and risk, and I am not prepared to do that.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So to what extent do you feel, as a Minister, you owe the taxi drivers a living?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I do not, I owe the public of Jersey to ensure that they have a sustainable service.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Because if you deregulate I gather one of the other consequences will be that certain services provided by taxis become more difficult, for example, Sunday rides, disabled taxis, all those sort of things could be threatened. Just the cheap routes, if you like.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

And if you want to ... again it is about public safety as well in terms of public service vehicle licence holders effectively go through a process which means that there are certain standards. If you completely deregulate the industry then you do not necessarily have that control over the quality of it.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

But there is a difference of course between deregulating insofar as putting more cars on the road, making it easier for people to get that permit to do the P.S.V. (passenger service vehicle) rather than necessarily restricting the number. So no one I do not think would suggest let anyone drive and to hell with the safety consequences, but there clearly are different permutations.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is a delicate balance between supply and demand. There are peaks of demand at certain hours of the day and certain times of the week that we need to try and ensure that those are met. But similarly there is a substantial part of the day, a substantial part of the week where demand is a lot less than the supply available, and it is trying to manage those imbalances.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Shall we stick with transport and look at other aspects of it? In February you said you were updating the Sustainable Transport Policy. Are you able to tell us any more about how that work is going?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The Sustainable Transport Policy we are due to report on and in fact you mentioned it in your report to the Minister for Environment on the Strategic Plan aspects. I think you requested that. We produced our update by July of this year, and that is something we are endeavouring to do. I have seen the first draft of it, it is currently going for its second time drafting, and that is something we hope ... we intend to produce in time for your deadline.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Are there any areas that ... I mean the ones that stick out because we have been talking about them for so many years, are the walking and cycling strategies that T.T.S. have been asked to develop, bring forward on many an occasion.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

As you know, we have made progress on that over the last few years in particular. Again, I have mentioned it a number of times in the States Assembly, I would quite like to see an expansion of

our cycle network. We are doing some work currently. We have an application in progress for Grouville, working with the Constable and the Deputy of Grouville on a Parish-led solution to that part of the eastern cycle track. We are working on a cycle track, we are hoping to start this summer, in St. Peter's Valley.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

What is the strategy ... it is more the strategy than the tracks. The tracks are great but the lack of a strategy means that, for example, you have got tourists cycling across the Royal Square and there is no strategic framework for the tourists, for example, who cycles or indeed the commuter who wants to cycle through town when the precincts are empty to get to work. I know that because the Roads Committee asked T.T.S. several years ago to look at ways in which we could make the town more cycleable and you need a strategic framework to do that. That simply is not there so we still have these situations with people who do not really know whether they are allowed to cycle in certain places or not.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

As you know, Chairman, we have both just come from a meeting with one of the remits from building, work, live ...

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

For the Future St. Helier.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

... and play, it all becomes part of Future St. Helier and those aspirations are built into what we are trying to do.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So we could see cycling become decriminalised in certain areas then?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think we need to be more tolerant as a community in how we interact in our different modes of transport.

**Director of Transport:**

Just a couple of things. The Planning Applications Panel has just approved this morning the new stretch of cycle path in Grouville, so that is a great positive. That extends the existing facility all the way to the Pembroke pub or to Grouville School and there are opportunities that lead on from that. We have got the planning application in for St. Peter's Valley at the moment and we also

undertook earlier on this year a campaign with the police, which was to encourage people to show more tolerance and be more aware of one another, cyclists and pedestrians, vehicle driving and pedestrians. It is a lot about being ... it is a lot about changing attitudes so that we do not have this "them and us" atmosphere on the roads and on the cycle paths because 'them' is us effectively.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Does that extend to the police though, when it is the actual police who are intolerant because they are just upholding the law, which says, for example, you cannot cycle on a very broad pavement. You cannot cut a light by going on a pavement. That seems to ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, I think that is a question for Home Affairs as opposed to a question for ...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

There should be joined-up thinking presumably so if we are talking about building a more tolerant society ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

You say we should be learning to live in a more tolerant ...

**Chief Officer:**

Beaumont Hill is a good example where you are allowed to cycle on the pavement. I think we should be looking at far more of those things because that enables people to do it safely because cycling on Beaumont Hill on the road is ... there is a big differential in speed between the car and the cyclist. On the pavement it feels safe and it is safe. But you are quite right. Going across Victoria Avenue at various points, the safe place to do it on a bicycle is across the pedestrian footways, and there is an unknown there; whether that is appropriate and safe to do so.

**Director of Transport:**

We certainly are looking at the options for that in the draft cycling and walking strategy. Certainly there are rules in France that we could refer to, so in France if you are under a certain age - I cannot remember which age it is, 8 or 10 - you can cycle on the footpath as long as you are accompanied by an adult. So you can play tunes on that depending on your location and the geometrical constraints and the criteria applied.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

That is music to my ears because you said the phrase “draft walking and cycling strategy”. Can you give us the date when that is going to appear because that is what we have been waiting for, for several years?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, we cannot.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

This year?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, we cannot.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

It may not appear this year? I mean I would certainly offer, I think it is something this panel can help do, is to formulate ... co-ordinate a group, because there is not currently a group meeting in Jersey talking about cycling strategy and I think it is something that we need as an Island. The Island is, for those who are physically able to, very cycleable.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Again, as you know, that came out of our previous meeting when we were looking at attendees for the workshop happening next weekend where we could not identify a body that represented ...

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Cyclists.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It did the generalist cyclists but not the sport cyclists.

**Chief Officer:**

I think it is a great idea and I think cycling is the new golf in terms of a pursuit for people, particularly middle-aged men.

[10:30]

It is becoming far more able for everybody to do it with hybrid bikes and electric bikes. Another issue with that, we need to sort of really grab hold of it because they are becoming far more

prevalent and far more enabling for people who may be not quite so fit or older. So it is a fantastic opportunity and Jersey is the perfect place because we have no through traffic. It is not as though we have got to cross a motorway. Victoria Avenue is not a motorway, it is just people going in the same direction.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

I think, to pick up Deputy Tadier's point, that we do need to address the illegality of quite a lot of things ...

**Chief Officer:**

Yes, I agree.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

... which elsewhere are considered quite acceptable.

**Director of Transport:**

What I would put forward operationally for me is where opportunities do present them we are grasping them. So we are creating more shared spaces. The Grouville path just referred to, part of that is on a shared footpath alongside the road and we have designated it as such so we do have the powers where we think that is a good place to put one, but we do do that already.

**Chief Officer:**

I think there is an opportunity for a steering group or some sort of oversight group that can start bringing these ideas in and then prioritising what we do and I completely agree, the unknown about where you can and cannot cycle is something ...

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Particularly if you are a public figure, I mean if I want to go from A to B in town, quite a lot of people know who I am. It is hard to get Havre des Pas from my house. It is an absolute nightmare because to cycle there legally is very difficult without getting on and off your bike all the time.

**Chief Officer:**

Same for me.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

If I am doing that at 7.00 a.m. when there is no one around then it does seem a bit odd that I cannot cycle, obviously giving priority to pedestrians, all that sort of thing, as you would expect. It



seems a bit odd that I cannot do that legally. It is interesting just from the sense that you are currently using the kind of strategic policy to inform your designation of the track. So I suspect that the strategy almost exists. It is just a matter of getting it written down.

**Director of Transport:**

We are working on the basis of the States Sustainable Transport Policy which is to encourage cycling and that recognises the benefits, not just in terms of road traffic accidents, but in terms of health and everything else. You get a plus from it and the Minister has been cycling to work, I cycle to work. We understand a lot of the issues.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Not to labour the point, but briefly we can look at one of the success stories, was the railway track. When I was growing up, for example, it was ... I do not think you were allowed to cycle on it and certainly it was frowned upon and you would get told off by your seniors for doing that. Now the shared usage seems to be completely accepted, completely the norm, so how do we get to that stage?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The problem with that is a culturist aspect, an aspect of the police initiative they did a few weeks ago along the cycle track at ... along the Avenue to St. Aubin's whereby they raised the awareness of both pedestrians and cyclists to be more aware of each other and to be more tolerant and we need to build on those types of initiative.

**Director of Transport:**

Just to add: the police do not work in isolation. We meet with the police regularly and we discuss these issues with them to try and make sure we do come up with a joint approach, and that campaign was one of the outcomes from that proactive approach by the police and us.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Perhaps I could encourage the panel to join the cycle challenge that starts on 1st June, for the whole of June.

**Director of Transport:**

Shall I check who has signed up? **[Laughter]**

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

There is always the danger of tokenism in these things.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I have signed up.

**Director of Transport:**

I am pleased to say Deputy Tadier has.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Moving swiftly on. **[Laughter]** A lot of cyclists these days of course can flout the speed limits because they go faster than quite a lot of our speed limits. Can I ask you where you are with the speed limit policy? We have constant requests from residents to introduce lower speed limits. We have a plethora of speed limits which personally I find quite confusing as a motorist and sometimes quite frustrating where you are being required to drive at a speed which seems almost punitively slow.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Wearing your Constable's hat, Chairman, you should have had or you are about to have an invite to a working party group for all 13 roads authorities and all 13 police authorities to discuss those topics. I want to get the views of all 13 roads authorities and all 13 police authorities to address, among other issues, that issue. I agree it does seem confusing to the public about the number of different types of speed, we have 4 different speed limits in the Island at least on the roads.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

You can spend more time looking at the speedometer than looking at the road, and that is trouble, is it not?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, so we need to work together. But it is about all 13 authorities working together on that. So I believe that, certainly from my memory, I think it is pencilled in for Friday, 26th June, and it is a whole morning event, so it should be in your diary or be coming into your diary shortly.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Can I ask a more general question about the Sustainable Transport Policy? One of the charges that is levelled at driving in Jersey is that it is just too cheap and that is the reason that people use the cars rather than other methods of transport. Of course it is complicated but one of those reasons is that it is too easy and too cheap to use your car. Of course there is going to be a backlash if there is any suggestion to make driving and, in particular, parking more expensive. But it does seem to me if you compare to other jurisdictions, apart from Guernsey, that parking is relatively cheap.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There are 2 words that you used there. One is it is complex and you are right, it is. And, 2, it is relative. To make a Sustainable Transport Policy work and to be able to achieve the targets that we originally set it did reinforce an existing States decision back in 2004 about the relative costs of the different forms of transport. To encourage more people to switch to other forms of transport away from the private car there needs to be some relativity in terms of a costing. You can improve services, for example, like the bus service, and you can improve cycle routes, you can improve pedestrian routes. But also without having addressing the relative costs of those different options, what you can achieve in any specific given period of time will be limited.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

It is not comparing like for like, but we have done it with smoking. Smoking is going down, and that is partly attributed to the price of cigarettes as well as getting information that is coming out. So is it something that can be done and applied to the car?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is something that you have to look at overall. Cigarette consumption, it has been coming down but that is because of a number of initiatives. You are right, there are different levers to pull and it is the same thing with our Sustainable Transport Policy. We have pulled lots of the levers in terms of improving the bus service, expanding the bus service. For example, our winter service now is the equivalent of the summer service 2 years ago so you can provide more provision, it has got to be convenient, it has got to be at the right times, it has got to be accessible and we are doing all that and will continue to do that to improve the service.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Is not the problem with parking that if you put up the prices of public car parks you are clearly affecting town traders, if you are talking about town car parks who want to encourage people to come into town, and all these people can park for free by going elsewhere for their shopping. So there is bound to be resistance to putting up the cost of public parking from the trading community, and also those who are not that well-off who are perhaps doing part-time jobs who need to park in the car parks to do their part-time work. One of the things I think we failed to tackle as a community is private non-residential parking. We provided huge areas of parking with planning consents so a lot of people who are driving into town in the morning are driving to a free parking space provided by their firm. So however much you put up the price in the car parks you are not affecting these people because they have already paid for their car, so they might as well use it. They are not paying for their parking and it seems to be unfair to put up the price of the public car parks and not to do anything about private non-residential.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Again, the actual parking provision within the town of St. Helier is the public parking is a minority. The private parking is a majority. You make a very good point there, Constable, and it is something that we are looking at. Other jurisdictions, other towns in the U.K., I think it is Nottingham, have introduced a levy on private parking spaces that are provided by ... it is a levy on the employer on spaces that they provide within the city centre for their employees. Just out of fairness that needs to be looked at.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

The city of Oxford, for example, for years has not allowed ... if you build an office in the city blocks you are not allowed to provide parking for your workers because that is seen as adding to the congestion coming into Oxford and they do not want all their staff to drive in.

**Chief Officer:**

Nottingham have invested the levy money into sustainable transport and a tram system so ... I visited Nottingham last year and it ... I used to live near Nottingham 20 years ago and it is a remarkable change. It looks like a vibrant European city as opposed to what it looked before, so it does make a difference. It takes a lot of political support and difficulty to do but I think the outcomes are very positive.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

So in conjunction with others, it is not just the ... it is the number of cars which does not necessarily equate with the number of people. I mean they are disproportionate. I presume there have been campaigns in the past to get car sharing involved.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It needs lots of levers. We are talking with the Constable of St. Peter and the Deputy of St. Peter about trying to trial a park-and-ride scheme from that part of the Island because it is quite a densely populated village there. It was trialled a couple of years ago in St. John. It was not deemed to be successful. There was not much uptake for the service. That could be because it was not targeted at a high density area. So there are lots of different levers and we need to use all of them to encourage people to change their mode of transport. If they choose cycling it is better for their health as well. There are other attributes. But it is almost like a keyboard on a piano and we have to play a number of the keys, not just one.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

I always feel I have to speak on behalf of the urban communities here because there is the danger that people living in the rural part of the Island will always have free parking, for example, but if you

live in town the likelihood is it is going to be more difficult to find a parking space. Urban dwellers, while they obviously will not drive to work or probably even drive their kids to school they do want to be able to drive out in the evening, they want to drive out in the weekends to pursue their leisure interests, so I think it is really important that motoring is not seen as a bad thing. It is not like smoking because you could argue that driving is quite good for you. If you are going out of a weekend to go fishing or to go sailing or to go for a walk on the north coast, then the ability to drive, to keep a car in town, is really important. So I do not think one should demonise it.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, not at all. What I would like to do is try to make it sustainable and make our transport system sustainable and the funding of it sustainable so we are not reliant on necessarily a direct subsidy from tax revenues.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

What does that look like? I mean how do we get to that?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

How we get to it is, to use my keyboard analogy, is that we have got to play a tune, not just one note. So it is about encouraging ... making provision for buses, making provision for cycle ways, making provision for pedestrians and also having realistic differentials between the different modes because of the different modes of transport.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Let me give you some specific examples and then tell me if you have got similar ideas because I think we need specifics. So, for example, you could give a free bus pass to anyone who does not have a car licence and as soon as they get a car licence they are not entitled to that. You could have a free bus day, you could do that for a week, see if that affects the amount of traffic on the roads. You could shut one of the lanes in the Avenue and say you are not allowed in this lane unless you have got more than one person in the car, unless you are a bus or whatever, or a motorcyclist. Those things would obviously create a stir but it would get people thinking about ... they are quite radical. Are there any of those kind of initiatives?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Again, if I can just pick up on one word that you use there, and that is "free". In reality nothing is free. So if you do provide a free bus pass to an individual someone is paying for that. Currently the taxpayers pay for that to the tune of £4 million a year, so nothing is free. We can do all those things but there is a cost.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

We did provide free parking, for example, if you own an electric car there is a space which is guaranteed for you in some car parks, you get free electricity from it, and often those spaces are vacant anyway.

**Chief Officer:**

They are subsidised.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Subsidised, okay.

**Chief Officer:**

50 per cent.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is not free.

**Chief Officer:**

And the electricity is not free. They have got to pay, I think, £10 a month.

**Director of Transport:**

Can I just comment also a little bit on the concept of free bus days? We have done that in the past but of course our buses are very well utilised now. We have had an 18.2 per cent growth from the beginning of the contract. If you are going to do or even consider something like that you have got to have the capacity because you do not want people that get the buses and then find they cannot get a place, they cannot sit down because then they have a poor experience and they never go back to the buses.

[10:45]

So you have to be more measured in how you approach these things because you want people to have a good experience if you are going to trial those things. We have done them in the past.

**Chief Officer:**

Just in terms of levers. We have got some studies done and looked at a wide range of things. The key balance, and I think the Constable raised it, is between keeping the town vibrant and people wanting to come to town and people wanting to shop in town, but also making sure that people do that in other forms of transport is a preferable route. One of the studies we undertook,

people who travel to town by bus spend more money in town than people who drive and we have done that ... we had that statistic just the other day, did we not? So it is quite ... because they tend to stop and have a drink and have lunch wherever, so it is a different sort of type of visit. So we need to be very careful with these levers. The levers are very political because the car and Jersey are intrinsically linked. We are not anti-car. What we want to do is for people to just not use it quite so often. I think it is pulling those levers, and the exciting things which gets you this difference. When you go to ... I was in Manchester last week. Manchester is not the same place it was 10, 15 years ago in the centre. There are people cycling. There are trams. There are people walking. There is the train system. It is a fundamentally different way. The European city has gone into the U.K. and Jersey, I think, is behind that.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Can I just pick up on a point here about in town and out of town parking provisions? We currently have planning gains for developments within town to provide a ratio of parking spaces for those developments or some type of commuted payment to provide parking provision. It is something I have been discussing with the Minister for Planning and, I do not want to put words into his mouth, but he is basically at the same place as I am. We need to be getting planning gains for those developments that are out of town for parking provision within town because it is the residents of St. Lawrence, St. John, Trinity; the country Parishes they do drive to town and they require a parking provision. So it does make sense those developments out of town should contribute to that provision and not just developments within town.

**Director of Transport:**

Can I just say one more positive thing about buses? I mean part of the success of LibertyBus is that it started to meet what was previously an unmet demand. So people wanted to use buses but the buses were not available or the seats were not available on the buses. So LibertyBus this summer is looking to increase, with the Minister's permission, the number of seats provided each day by an extra 3,200 seats per day. That is an investment that they are making and looking to do.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

They are also rolling out the Parish link network.

**Director of Transport:**

And there is the Parish link which enables people who cannot normally access public transport routes to get public transport. So that is a big step forward as well. These things grow slowly. It is like a seed and it takes a little time to grow.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Is the Parish link system going well? I mean it has been running for a month or so now.

**Director of Transport:**

I do not have up-to-date figures. I have got ... the report came in this morning but I have not had a look at it.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

There are still some areas on the outskirts of town where parking is free with a disc. I remember by the Grand Hotel, which is now residents parking, that was quite ... a very convenient place to pop into town, couple of hours you would walk so you are not really congesting town, do your shopping and then you could leave. But those areas have been reduced. Is there any scope for either getting rid of the ones that are currently, say, 3 hours, 6 hours down at the harbour, commercial buildings, charging for those, or extending the free parking on the out skirts of town to try and perhaps change behaviour?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Some of those parking spaces come under my remit as T.T.S. and some are the Parish. The ones you highlighted were Parish ones. Some come under Ports of Jersey as well. Certainly from my point of view I have asked officers to look at ... again parking in town is very complex. It is more complex than the range of our speed limits. In town you have got 10-minute drop-off zones. By the markets you have got 20-minute zones. You have got hour zones. You have got the multi-storey car parks themselves. As a user it is very complex about how long you can park where we have got different hours of parking. In a Parish space around the ring road, for example, you get charged up to 10.00 p.m. in the evening. It is very complex and I think there is a piece of work to be done that will involve the Parish and Ports of Jersey and other provisions of parking such as, for example, Andium, ourselves, to come up with a more simplified, more comprehensive range of parking provision.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

I think we need to move off transport, if we may. I want to ask you about Property Holdings and the office strategy. South Hill have been talked about for years as a potential site for homes. I have still got T.T.S. and Planning up there. What is the future of that?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Just not to get the wrath of another Scrutiny Panel, I cannot talk to you today wearing my Property Holdings hat about the office strategy. I can talk to you today wearing my T.T.S. about our provision, which is at South Hill. We would like to move from South Hill and facilitate the



development of that site as soon as possible but that is dependent on finding someone else for us and the Environment Department that are currently there. The office strategy will require some funding and it will be in the next Medium-Term Financial Plan. What I can tell you is that I set up a ministerial oversight group to drive forward the office strategy and we are going to ... the first meeting of that will be held in June.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

It seems odd that there are, particularly with businesses moving, that is where they are going to the waterfront site, to bigger offices, consolidating and so on, that there are places becoming available in town that I would have thought T.T.S. would fit into and Planning could fit into, so that would free up South Hill and we could get on with providing much needed homes on that site.

**Chief Officer:**

From a T.T.S. business perspective our business predominantly is at La Collette and at Bellozanne. There are small elements at Warwick Farm and I believe we should be closer to our business. So the T.T.S. solution is out of town completely because we do not need to pay the premium to be in town. We would move tomorrow if we got a chance because being at South Hill is, I think, an historical thing. I do not know why the business is based there, to be honest, and I would move out tomorrow.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Is there any prospect of space becoming available at La Collette or Bellozanne?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

La Collette is difficult in terms of office space at La Collette. The hazards that are there. There is scope at Bellozanne but again it comes down to priorities and money at the end of the day. What we intend to do with the office strategy is to ensure that we unlock that conundrum, which is a common conundrum.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

I can see there is a good argument of putting Planning in town where they are more accessible to the public without traipsing up to South Hill but ... and even if you go up to Bellozanne I would have thought that piece of work could be done fairly quickly.

**Chief Officer:**

Apart from the fiscal elements we are very happy to move to Bellozanne even into temporary accommodation. The benefit of Bellozanne is it is in a position of transition because the Energy from Waste plant's gone. The new sewage treatment works development has been progressed,

so there is opportunity there. It is just unlocking the fiscal elements to enable us to do it. As an organisation we are not holding back and I would move tomorrow because I need to be closer.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

That is interesting.

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

Sorry, I understand you right, Jersey Property Holdings Limited is a function to be transferred or are you saying that is outside your domain at the moment?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

For this Scrutiny Panel I am the political lead for Property Holdings, wearing my Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources' hat, but the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel called that piece of legislation in and it has been lodged and is up for debate. They are quite sensitive about me ...

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

No, I just want to be clear. So we cannot ask you a question about Fort Regent at the moment, for instance?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Not in this format, I am afraid not. I wish I could. We had this sort of thing in the States at questions without notice; Deputy Hilton asked me a question about asbestos in schools, which I could not answer.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

To the extent that it affects your department though, I mean how would you be involved, your department in the redevelopment of Fort Regent?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well we will be heavily involved when hopefully the States will agree with my desire to bring Property Holdings into T.T.S. to create an infrastructure department. The Fort Regent Steering Group is something that I currently chair. It is envisaged that I will not chair that going forward because I would like that to be chaired by the end user, the people responsible for the end use of that, which would be effectively a subsection of E.D.D. (Economic Development Department), probably the Sports Assistant Minister.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I suppose we can ask about timescales though?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We will be involved in delivering the product.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

What is the timescale we are looking at on that roughly?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Fort Regent, we have already said, we have already issued the papers on that, and it is going to cross the next 2 or 3 M.T.F.P.s.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

It is dependent on the M.T.F.P. is it not, if it succeeds in that or not?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are talking about the 10-year plus project.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

I have exhausted my questions. Do you ...?

**The Deputy of St. Mary:**

If Jersey Property Holdings is a non-area then, yes.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I wish I could answer. I am willing to but I do not want to upset the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel.

**The Connétable of St. Helier:**

It has been very useful, some very useful things have been raised today which I look forward to progressing. Thank you very much for your candid replies and we look forward to the next one. Thank you to the media and the public, the media especially for coming. It is just the media, is it not? Thank you to our clerks. Thank you very much.

[10:57]